

Between no church and cyber Pentecostals: religious modus vivendi in the society under mediatization

Souza, Catiane Rocha Passos de; Matos, Rita de Cássia de Aragão

Veröffentlichungsversion / Published Version

Zeitschriftenartikel / journal article

Empfohlene Zitierung / Suggested Citation:

Souza, C. R. P. d., & Matos, R. d. C. d. A. (2017). Between no church and cyber Pentecostals: religious modus vivendi in the society under mediatization. *ESSACHESS - Journal for Communication Studies*, 10(2), 33-51. <https://nbn-resolving.org/urn:nbn:de:0168-ssoar-55487-7>

Nutzungsbedingungen:

Dieser Text wird unter einer CC BY-NC Lizenz (Namensnennung-Nicht-kommerziell) zur Verfügung gestellt. Nähere Auskünfte zu den CC-Lizenzen finden Sie hier: <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/deed.de>

Terms of use:

This document is made available under a CC BY-NC Licence (Attribution-NonCommercial). For more information see: <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0>

Between no church and cyber Pentecostals: religious *modus vivendi* in the society under mediatization

Dr. Catiane Rocha Passos de SOUZA
Instituto Federal da Bahia (IFBA)
BRAZIL
catirochapassos@gmail.com

Dr. Rita de Cássia de Aragão MATOS
Universidade Federal da Bahia (UFBA)
BRAZIL
rivalta@uol.com.br

Abstract: The present work aims to analyze evidences of new identity procedures in Brazilian Pentecostalism, increasingly interpenetrated into the mediatization logics. Among the new procedures, the cyber Pentecostals assert themselves or establish themselves in the digital medias with a sense of an activist citizenship. Since it is a procedure that almost always seems to be autonomous and independent of institutional regulation, it also reaches the no church: Pentecostals who left the temples for several reasons. For this analysis, we based ourselves in notions developed in the Latin current of Mediatization Studies, especially the works Eliseo Véron, Fausto Neto, Pedro Gomes and Luiz Braga. The *corpus* under analysis in the present article consist of posts of EIG (Evangélicas pela Igualdade de Gênero¹), a movement formed by/for women since 2015, mainly Pentecostals, aiming to promote discussions about the violence against woman.

Keywords: cyber Pentecostals, circulation, mediatization, nonchurch, gender

Entre les sans église et les cyber pentecôtistes: le modus vivendi religieux dans la société en médiatisation

Résumé: Ce travail vise à analyser les nouvelles processualités d'identité dans le pentecôtisme brésilien, de plus en plus interpénétré avec les logiques de la médiatisation. Parmi les nouvelles processualités, les cyberpentecôtistes s'affirment ou se constituent dans les médias digitaux dans la logique d'une citoyenneté militante. Puisqu'il s'agit d'une processualité qui apparaît, presque toujours, comme une autonomie et une indépendance institutionnelle, elle atteint aussi les sans église: les

¹ Evangelical for Gender Equality.

pentecôtistes qui ont cessé d'aller aux temples pour diverses raisons. Pour cette analyse, nous nous sommes focalisés sur des notions développées par les études sur la médiatisation d'Eliseo Véron, Fausto Neto, Pedro Gomes et Luiz Braga. Le *corpus* analysé dans cet article se compose de publications de l'EIG (Évangéliques pour l'Égalité de Genre), mouvement formé, depuis 2015, par/pour les femmes, principalement les pentecôtistes, visant à promouvoir les discussions sur la violence contre les femmes.

Mots-clés: circulation, cyberpentecôtistes, médiatisation, genre, sans église

Introduction

Brazilian Pentecostalism is an ever-changing religiosity since its arrival in the country (1910) until the present days, being organized, foremost, in the intersection with the logics of mediatization (Braga, 2015). From the 1980s, the changes of the Pentecostal asceticism became more visible and discussed in the society in general and academic environment, especially due to purchasing power of concessions and companies from the communication sector. The groups named neo Pentecostals are which the most have invested in medias, they are known too by the emphasis on the Prosperity Theology, Christian doctrine which defends that the financial blessing is the desire of God for the Christians and that the faith, the positive discourse and the donations for the Christian ministries will always increase the material wealth of the faithful. After the 2000s, the radial effects of the referred process could be notice in the economy with the rise of gospel culture and, more significantly, in politics with the articulation of institutional candidacies and parliamentary bench.

Alongside the mediatization of social processes, (neo)Pentecostal churches are affected by the acceleration of some phenomena such as secularization of worship, greater purchasing power of their public, modernization of the temples, acceleration of religious transit, virtual communities formation, besides other phenomena related to media logics, especially digital medias. Some religious even address as post-Pentecostalism the developments in the new media environment (Araújo, 2014). The "acceleration of time" in the age of Internet is much more dynamic and faster than in any other period of mediatization process. Verón (2013) discusses how Internet changed the access conditions of the individual agents to knowledge and information, resulting in unprecedent changes in the media discourse circulation. Besides, the Internet enables the individuals to control, to a certain extent, their temporal-spatial access and consumption conditions, also modifying the others media devices. The increase of the capacity to acquire technological devices with Internet access reconfigure interpersonal communication: "the logics of social bond are no longer where we have been used to seek" (Verón, 2013, p. 276).

The new context of the society in the process of mediatization adds new working logics to the social processes. Religion, in this new paradigm, reorganizes itself, following the evolution of the mediatization process in society. The Pentecostalism

in Brazil gets in the 21st century with a configuration rather complex: an explosion of hybrid and individualized Pentecostalism. Since the 1950s, the number of heterogeneous – but unified by the Pentecostal message – denominations proliferated. From the 2000s on the bonds are less institutional, more autonomous.

The proliferation of access to the digital medias in the poorer section of population of the country is transforming, among other social dimensions, the religiosities that are constituted in these spaces, such as Brazilian Pentecostalism. In digital medias, the religious experience became less dependent of the temple-space or TV program, nor is limited to the worship temporality. The believer defines the space-time of his/her worship, the way he/she will carry out his/her worship, his/her practices, the message or sermon he/she wishes to listen to, all through the digital medias that make available such materials “for free” and also provide an environment of religious socialization, formation of selective communities according to the profiles and interests of each believer-user.

According to Gomes (2017), mediatization is a reconfiguration of a communicational ecology (or a media bios). Such reconfiguration “redesign the platform of interactional processes, especially the scope of message circulation, sitting the *status* of message receivers in new conditions, turning them into co-producers of media discourse activities” (Fausto Neto, 2011, p. 37). Therefore, it is in the scope of circulation that a “new ambience” is formed, where the social fields establish the contract and contact with each other. The reconfiguration of the media circulation status redirects the view about the mediatization. In this new ambience, it is presumed that the sense of surveillance of physical body is minimized, as well as the discourse of the customs traditionally followed in the Pentecostal churches maintenance and also the proselytism became less pronounced in the digital medias than in the TV and radio. The most traditional Pentecostal churches started to approach of the mode of being of the neo Pentecostals groups. At the end of these transformations, other aspects were added. For example, it was enhanced in these virtual spaces a sense of political-participative identification.

1. From no church to cyber Pentecostals

The new ambience formed by digital medias optimized others ways to individual keep being religious or become religious without even attend temples or in-person meetings. This reality reaches in larger scale the in transit religious that have been changing the indicator of Brazilian Protestantism, increasing the number of Pentecostals without declared denominations, which means, Pentecostals without a church. On the other hand, the growth rate of large Pentecostals and/or neo Pentecostals denominations is reducing. The 2010 census of IBGE² identified 25.370.484 Pentecostals belonging to the churches. The particular emphasis is the 5.267.029 who self declare Pentecostals of origin with diverse affiliations, since in 2000 they

² Brazilian Institute of Geography and Statistics.

were only 1.840.581. Another interesting data is that in 2000 the census classified 1.046.487 “Pentecostals without institutional link”, differently from 2010 when it joined into the classification of “evangelical not determined” and the number went from 9.218.129.

Due to this process, some researches announce the decline of large Pentecostals institutions, since the religious pilgrimage and the number of “Pentecostals without institution” speed up greatly. The pilgrim pursues in the transit to find a religiosity in which he/she can identify him/herself in a more complete way and the main result of such pursuing is the increasing religious plurality nowadays. The figures of the converted and pilgrim are emblematic of the contemporary Christian; they are faces of a multiplicity attached to the Christian stem which, even though they stimulate the field, do not break with the ideological matrix. In the digital medias, the two emblematic figures of the contemporary religious merge themselves: the pilgrim and the converted (Hervieu-Léger, 2008). In the virtual space, the converted does not have to give up of his/her pilgrimage. On the contrary, the pilgrimage can become a way of enhance the conversion by affirming his/her identification in all cyberspaces in which he/she pilgrim.

Digital vehicles do not lead religious organizations to reach out many people out of their faith community. In fact, the new medias are more used to promote the communication between individuals already belonging to a religious community, while encourage them to adopt a more independent attitude towards religious institutions. (Hjarvard, 2014, p. 140).

In such context, it arises the no churched (neo)Pentecostals who left the temples for many reasons: administration, structure or ecclesiastic leadership disapproval; rejection to the Prosperity Theology; condemnation of judgments and pressure of the others brothers in relation to the observance of the ways and customs etc. These no churched, currently, articulate themselves throughout digital medias and are contrary to the traditional religious institutionalization and in favor of the “return to the sacred”. Some attract followers and create virtual communities as a religious permanence mechanism. They believe in the Pentecostal preaching, but do not want to report their lives to the minister or brothers of the church. Most of the no churched don't agree with the discourse of Prosperity Theology, even more present in the (neo)Pentecostals temples, unlike the digital networks where prevail a more politic-citizen discourse.

By using the digital medias such individuals socialize with the ones whom frequent the temples or other people in the same condition, however without having pressures of any type or constraints concerning the personal behavior, especially when it comes to the rules to control the body, one the highest cares of religion. Many groups in Facebook platform, blogs and other interactive cyberspaces formed themselves with the title of “no churched”. The majority is people who used to go to the temples but are unsatisfied with the leaderships, the type of organizational structure or the operating modes of the churches. These virtual communities assemble a

significant number of such kind of religious, which means, individuals who do not abandon religious faith, still believe in the dogmas, behave themselves in a typical religious people way, manifest publicly by using a discourse and language from the religion but do not go anymore to temples or meetings at home, halls, etc. This new way of coexistence is set in the contemporary context marked by the destructuring of traditional forms of organization. It is a new cultural relationship with the world: “generalized process of deinstitutionalization and interconnection, of circulation and deterritorialization, ordering new frames of social, cultural and individual life” (Lipovetsky & Serroy, 2011, p. 33).

Such type of religious who do not go to church have always existed in Brazilian Catholicism. The difference of the no churched Pentecostals is that they arise in an articulated way in the contemporaneity, when the digital medias provide people the capacity to integrate into virtual communities, forming groups who manifest themselves against institutions and religious specialists, but in favor of principles, values and dogmas established by the religion.

Freston (2011), in the article “How will the Brazilian Evangelical Church be in 2040?”³ discusses the tendency for the coming decades in diminish the growth of churches that have gained the highest amount of members since 1950, in this case the Pentecostal churches. Freston address such tendency as if the cooling of institutional growth was the natural course of any religious movement after reaching a large number of followers. In this way, it neglects the context in which the society becomes increasingly engendered in the media logics. In the article, the author highlights the utilitarian values assigned to Protestant religiosity as a sort of bargain culture that can be overcome by the discourse of religion defense as a political cause, such as the most ideological political movements do (Freston, 2011).

The replacement of the bargain culture for the “dedication to a cause” has been happening at the moment, since the Prosperity Theology Discourse gets less emphasized due to another discourse devoted to the defense, sometimes, of neglected rights in society. However, most of the Pentecostals defend a conservative morality understood as lost or under crisis. Such replacement reveals itself in a strong way among the Pentecostals who share posts and/or create groups in the social media, take part of sites, blogs, etc., becoming closer because of speech affinities. It is a new process of identification in Brazilian Pentecostalism: a procedure independent of institutional regulation, also embracing the “no churcheds”. The term cyber Pentecostal is here as a reference to the cybe rculture notion of Pierre Lévy as a specific culture of the society interconnected through cyberspaces. According to Levy (1999), the interconnection is the categorical imperative of cyber culture.

Along with cyber culture arises the desire to construct a social bond that is based not on territorial or institutional affiliations, or relationships of power, but on common interests, games, shared knowledge, cooperative apprenticeship, open processes of collaboration. Our desire for virtual communi-

³ Original title: Como será a igreja evangélica brasileira de 2040?

ties reflects an ideal of deterritorialized human relationship, nonhierarchical and free. Virtual communities are the engines and agents, the multiform and astonishing life-forms of the universal through contact. (Levy, 1996, p. 111).

Virtual communities represent a way for individuals remain (neo)Pentecostals, in the case of the no church, or even to reaffirm themselves based on a “cause”. The majority of cyber Pentecostals only want to learn more about their faith and share it, discuss it and keep in touch with other brothers, a not typical behavior of this religious group once posts about religiosities are the most common in virtual environments. Another important factor to be considered is that the greater part of internet users adopts in the virtual environment a profile different from the real life one, a lot of them publishes fake information; some even adopt evangelical profiles to infiltrate in these communities with diverse interests.

The sense of citizenship and political activism creates a strong power of mobilization in the digital medias. Among the cyber Pentecostals, the sense of community that is already improved in the coexistence of the churches associates itself to the strengthening of an activist citizenship; they become highly active in issues of mutual interest, acquiring a defense value that they would not have in other virtual communities. Mostly, the causes are of the “salvation of the family flag”, as discussed by Cunha (2017), widely advocated by the church leaders Silas Malafaia, Marco Feliciano (PSC-SP⁴) and others, especially politicians. Nonetheless, other causes, including topics silenced in the Pentecostal churches, begin to be defended. They are raised by religious from the same current and the believers give great credit. It makes the messages circulation between them easier. The term “believer” in Brazil is adopted, above all, in reference to the (neo)Pentecostal evangelical.

2. From morality conservatism to political alignment

In this scenario of religious institutional bonds cooling, there is a movement, which reinforces the identification through the political discourse over the religious. Before the 1980s, Pentecostals were aside from any manifestation or political engagement, they did not accept the participation of the religious, nor even make room for issues related to politics in the churches. They said that politics was not a believer’s topic:

Every time the elections were coming up, they got radical by saying that “politics is a Devil’s thing” and the believers cannot get involved with it. In general, it prevails the view contrary to the believer’s involvement with politics, a sort of religious apoliticism (Araújo, 2014, p. 703).

Campos (2002) distinguished two stages of the relationship between politics and Pentecostals, defined by the Federal Constitution of 1988: before 88, just a few were

⁴ A Right wing party from Brazil, the Christian Social Party, of conservative ideology.

elected by personal and familiar merits. The author treats them as “evangelical politicians”. After the Constitution, we have candidacies articulated in political projects planned by the churches: the “politicians of Christ”. Although it began during the 1980s, it was from 2000 on that such articulation gained strength. In 2003, the creation of an Evangelical Parliamentary Front (FPE⁵), also known as Evangelical Bench, made the interests of the Evangelical Churches stronger, mainly the (neo)Pentecostal. The FPE consists mostly of deputies from Assemblies of God (ADs⁶) and Universal Church of the Kingdom of God (IURD⁷) who oppose in many situations but hold together in order to defend the moral conservatism:

Reflecting this course, in the elections of 2010 the Evangelical Bench reached the highest number of elected representatives in its whole history: 73 federal deputies and 3 senators. During the election campaign of many of them it was distinguished the dissatisfaction with several advances in the minority rights area (Cunha, 2017, p. 91).

According to Alencar (2013, p. 251), the interest in politics is not the goal of those who attend to the ADs, but of those who lead them: “The *external politization* is the articulation of the summit and not of the Church”. The leaders articulate themselves certain of the obedient believers support. The brief background of political participation of the ADs reveal us a new configuration, “its political participation has gone from one extreme to another: from a total alienation to a theocratic outbreak” (Alencar, 2013, p. 251). The (neo)Pentecostalism follows the current tendency by electing politicians to defend specific causes, further fragmenting and particularizing the political field aligned with the neoliberal platform that advocates the minimal Federal Government action, market sovereignty, moral conservatism, among other issues

Such contemporary phase of Pentecostal mediatization process put those classic Pentecostals close to the neo Pentecostals, especially because resulted in the party politicization of the ADs. In this context, the (neo)Pentecostal engagement in politics gave rise to the battle discourse, in which the politicians of Christ pose themselves as soldiers against the “families’ enemies”. They distinguish themselves due to the way they appropriate the media devices and the Prosperity Theology, but were (re)integrated into the political articulation. This articulation is a new mechanism of Pentecostal unity guided by the conservative morality principles, which are at risk according to these politicians. The discourse mentioned also finds strength in the moralists; many are not even member of any evangelical denomination. In social medias the discourse of moral defense goes beyond church labels and is related to the Brazilian “cultural superego”.

The moral defense appears in the political projects of the Assemblies of God (ADs), an institution of classic Pentecostalism, thus with a more conservative profile

⁵ Portuguese initials.

⁶ Original term: Assembleias de Deus.

⁷ Original term: Igreja Universal do Reino de Deus.

than the neo Pentecostals churches. The Theology of Morality was the main counterpoint of the Prosperity Theology that mastered the neo Pentecostalism. Besides, it is the explanation used to convince a “brother to vote in another brother”. It is worth reminding that the expression “Brother vote in Brother⁸” derives from the title of Josué Silvestre’s book, an Assembly of God attendee (Brasília: Pergaminho, 1986). The book is a reference in the development of the Manual of Political Orientation for Ministers of the ADs, created in 2001 by the institutional leaders.

(Neo)Pentecostal politicians work more on projects with ideological tenor. As an example, they were against the project of criminalization of homophobia, of legalization of abortion, of legalization of marijuana, of legalization of the union of same sex partners; also, they are against the discussion of gender and sexuality in schools, in favor of religious education, etc. Such political moralist attitude is observed since the beginning of the process of Brazilian re-democratization, when

a presence in the Constituent Congress was seen as a curb on such threat, represented throughout the whole Left wing, whose flags match with the communist ideals and also feminist, homosexual, “marijuana users” and “witchdoctor”, in accordance with the evangelical imagination (Cunha, 2017, p. 37).

Nowadays, the investment in moral debate is a mechanism widely adopted by the conservative politicians, either evangelical or not. An example of the power of such discourse was recognized during the voting on the admission of the President Dilma Rousseff impeachment process in the House of the Representatives, on April 17 2016, in which the defense of God, family and homeland were the main arguments, with very little mentions to the process under debate. In front of the whole nation through medias in general, the deputies justified their votes on behalf of constituencies, family members and God, to whom they made references in a variety of sentences. The interdiscourses brought up mostly Christian institutions and inferences: “Beneath the blessing of the Great Architect of the Universe”, “for the evangelicals of this nation and against the Darkness Party”, “for a 78-year-old father who taught me the principles of God’s word”, “for the evangelical nation”, “for the Charismatic Renewal”, “for the Foursquare Family”, “for the Christian foundations”, “for the peace in Jerusalem”, among others.

The quotation of the deputy Éder Mauro (PSD⁹-PA) stating that he was against all the “gangsters” who want to ruin the country under the “proposal that a child change his/her sex and learn sex in the school with 6 years” raised a dispute between the evangelical bench and politicians in favor, for example, of projects such as “School without Homophobia”. Under the context of the voting of the President *impeachment* process, such statements conduct to a spiritual imaginary battle, on one side the Christians and on the other side the “ravenous lions”, just as in the Colosseum of ancient Rome. Those who proclaimed on behalf of God put themselves in

⁸ In the original, “Irmão vota em Irmão”.

⁹ A Center wing party in Brazil, the Social Democratic Party, of social democrat ideology.

an apparent war of good against evil, in which the good always win for the sake of family and moral. The voting scenario brought a historical-ideological showcase of discourses, on which the representatives of several segments and political parties stand. The architecture of the political power in the country has been bringing the evidences of an activist religiosity strengthening in favor of the parties and Right wing candidacies. The site of El País in June of 2016 brought the article of Luiz Ruffato, entitled “Temer opens the Evangelical Republic¹⁰”, detailing the approximation of the present government with the evangelical bench.

After the municipal elections in 2016, the numbers of members of evangelical benches in City Councils in various municipalities doubled, including in capital cities such as Salvador and São Paulo. In Rio de Janeiro, Marcelo Crivella (PRB¹¹), nephew of Bishop Edir Macedo (leader of IURD and owner of Rede Record¹²) was elected. According to data published in the article “Universal Church moves forward¹³”, in the site El País, the IURD controls a media complex composed by Rede Record, present in 93% of Brazil and in 150 countries; the TV Universal, with more than 20 television retransmitters; the Rede Aleluia, with almost eighty AM and FM radio stations, present in 75% of national territory. Apart from TV and radio, it is part of IURD’s media complex the Internet portal universal.org., the newspaper *Folha Universal*, the magazines *Plenitude*, *Obreiro de Fé* and *Mão Amiga*, the publisher *Unipro*, which registers sale of millions of books of Edir Macedo and other ministers, and the gospel record label *Line Records*.

The election of Rio de Janeiro represented the polarization of politics in the country, on the Right the conservative religious and on the Left Marcelo Freixo (PSOL¹⁴) who defends drugs and abortion regulation, homosexual and black people rights and a greater participation of the society in the power. The elections of 2016 revealed a great commitment of the “politicians of Christ”: a survey made by VEJA website about the mayor’s, vice-mayor’s and councilor’s candidacies in all Brazilian capital cities found 250 candidates who brings to the polls holy, stickers and along with their names their evangelical hierarchical functions. It were 195 ministers candidates, 33 missionaries, 14 bishops, 7 apostles and 1 presbyter.

3. Cyber Pentecostalism and the new possibilities

The media involvement process acceleration that started in 1980s can be observed throughout the transformations provided by the religious contact with other discursive formations, especially the media one. Such contact is not static but rather dynamic, since it happens in motion streams as a driving force. Using the expressions of Verón (1980), it is “discourses clutch”: “This mechanical image is the one

¹⁰ Original title: *Temer inaugura a república evangélica*.

¹¹ A Right wing party in Brazil, the Brazilian Republican Party, of liberal conservatism ideology.

¹² An open and commercial television broadcast network.

¹³ Original title: *A Igreja Universal avança*.

¹⁴ A Left wing party in Brazil, the Socialism and Freedom Party, of socialist ideology.

of articulation, a nesting, *which set in motion*. That is why we talk about discourse *clutch*. This discourse clutch sets the semiosis in motion at time, in the situations in which circulates” (Verón, 1980, p. 221).

The access to the new ambience allowed the (neo) Pentecostals to have contact with silenced topics and/or the ones treated with restriction in the churches. In this discourse clutch, insofar as these topics are recognized by such religious, the religiosity itself gets updated and the process of media involvement become accelerated, because they start to affect and be affected in the contact with the media discourse. One of these topics, almost always silenced in/by the churches is the violence against women. This silencing results in a state of moral indifference in face of the violence against women, a serious problem in Brazilian society. In order to recognize the clues of new Pentecostal identification procedures in digital media, we will observe the discourses clutch constituted in two platforms appropriated by EIG (Evangélicas pela Igualdade de Gênero¹⁵).

There are some clues that help us to build possibilities of study in order to have another understanding of the occurrence of “cyber culture” in the society, language and culture, primarily according to how we establish our links and appropriation models with their “senses” offer and also how we focus on our production of meanings (Fausto Neto, 2001, p. 123).

EIG has a blog and a Facebook page. In the blog, they talk about the origin of EIG in 2015 during the meeting of the Latin American Pentecostal Forum (FPLC¹⁶) and describe their goals: “start all and any work, together with protestant women, especially the Pentecostals and neo Pentecostals ones, joining forces, exchanging testimonies, experiences with other evangelicals who are in such journey for a longer period”. The guiding principle of EIG is the violence against women, either in the domestic and workspace or the churches. In the blog and Facebook page, EIG publishes testimonies of evangelical women who experienced violence. In addition to the testimonies, there are posts of news produced by diverse medias related to the guiding principle, posts of activities and actions promoted and/or performed by EIG participants, such as participation in events, academic congresses, protests, workshops, etc. One action was the publication of the book organized by EIG, “Evangélicas por sua Voz e Participação – Gênero em Discussão¹⁷” (2015).

In 2016, the researcher Valéria Cristina Vilhena, co-founder of EIG, published another book “Uma Igreja sem voz: análise de gênero da violência doméstica entre mulheres evangélicas¹⁸”, a Master research result that points out a high level of violence against evangelical women. Domestic violence in Brazil has historical roots in the naturalization of gender inequality. The silence about the problem is not specific

¹⁵ Evangelical for Gender Equality.

¹⁶ Portuguese initials, meaning Fórum Pentecostal Latino-Americano.

¹⁷ A possible translation of the title: “Evangelical Women for their Voice and Participation – Gender under Discussion”

¹⁸ A possible translation of the title: “A voiceless Church: domestic violence among evangelical women gender analysis”

to evangelical community. Withal, in this community other factors contribute to the silencing of the topic, for example: the discourse of female “incapacity” for leadership positions, whose effects are the female voice restriction in the pulpits, protecting the system created by men in order to hold on to each other; female accountability for the marriage or child rearing failure, among other discourses that blame women for the violence experienced.

Next, we will analyze three posts that indicate characteristics of cyber Pentecostalism in EIG. First of all, it must be pointed out that it is a movement directed by/to Pentecostal women. The first image is a post from August 08, 2017 that circulated an article from Extra Newspaper (online). The article brings a testimonial of an evangelical women victim of domestic assault and presents statistical data about violence against women in the state of Rio de Janeiro. In the report, it appears evidences of omission from religious leaders concerning the assault situation.



Source: <https://www.facebook.com/evangelicaspelaigualdadedegenero/>.
Access in 08/31/2017.

Image 1. Post about «moral indifference» to domestic violence

The moral indifference causes atrocities throughout the history. In “Modernity and the Holocaust”, Bauman (1998) raises three moral indifference conditions: (1) the violence becomes authorized by the institutions and the State; (2) the victims of the violence dehumanization due to ideological questions; (3) discipline that suppresses one’s identity (self-sacrifice). In this work, the sociologist reflects upon how the appropriation of moral indifference by the Nazi regime was operated with a magnificent industry, transportation, science, bureaucracy and technology device.

Proposing a discussion about the domestic violence in a conservative universe, such as the Pentecostal, means fighting against the moral indifference. It represents a deviation from the Pentecostal female public behavior, almost always submitted to male sovereignty. This deviation was only possible in the society in the process of mediatization when adherent forms were given to the identification processes in new production methods. Such methods were focused on ideological accession, causes, defense in the spaces of media discourse circulation where the disputes between transformations or maintenance of the sense happen. In this context, digital medias are fed through volunteer work of countless agents who, facing the illusion of gratuity and in favor of an ideological cause, act in the maintenance of a media circulation global industry. Therefore, the exacerbation of the notion, in order to demonstrate the freedom condition it is needed, to express and place yourself before ideological causes, reinforce the sense of activism in the Pentecostal which, in the digital medias, is aligned with the new production methods. In this sense, we point out the first characteristic of cyber Pentecostalism in EIG, since it appropriates of the digital media to promote an activism concerning the struggle for equal rights and against the violence to women, topics silenced especially in the Brazilian Pentecostalism spaces.

The second characteristic of cyber Pentecostalism we can recognize in the posts of EIG is about the growth of individual autonomy, in the context of the bloom of digital media access, allowing the institutional affiliation waiver which changes the logics of religious bonds. In such configuration, autonomous religious group together and/or self-declare as Pentecostals, but without church titles. In face of institutional links cooling and the changes of the present world asceticism, the defense of a cause can establish itself as a “new” identification process. To a certain extent, they are religious who, in the struggle for rights, expect a sort of “return to the sacred”. In the digital medias, they add to religiosity: values, characteristics and discourses inherent to the communities formed in virtual spaces. In this context of institutional bonds weakening, some posts promote discourses contrary to the institutions (churches) current ways of working. It is an example the post published in August 25, 2017:



Source: <https://www.facebook.com/evangelicaspelaigualdadedegenero/>.
Access in 08/31/2017.

Image 2. Advertising of tithe machine

The post carries the advertising of a machine to make offers and tithes in the temples. Above the advertising, there is the EIG statement: «When I think I have seen everything». The effects of the meaning are disapproval to how the institutions deal with the donations and tithes in the present days. The existence of such contribution is highly associated to the need of temple maintenance. The existence of temples, worship spaces, evoked in the Pentecostalism a discursive practice of offer and tithe appreciation, of material contribution and, more recently, institutionalized trade. This collection practice, often, is released as a missionary activity. Consequently, it is essential to the “believer” who intends to fulfill a “divine determination” by spreading the gospel of Christ. This practice promotes in the religious who believe in tithes and offers a sense of right of complaint, legitimizing the act of demand from God what has been “applied”. Prosperity Theology improved this discourse, since according to the neo Pentecostals the believer must determine, decree, claim and demand from God that He fulfills his part in the agreement and, while setting a mutual relationship with Him, He is obliged to accomplish all biblical promises in believer’s life.

Due to the greater number of no churched, one of the biggest concerns of the Pentecostals leaders is that the congregations, at least the majority of them, are compounded of few funder believers. The Assemblies of God, for example, have a great number of small temples financially supported by the believers from the mainte-

nance costs to God workers' salary. In the article "The no churcheds¹⁹", written by Pastor Carlos Roberto Silva, published in the ADs institutional newspaper "Mensagem da Paz" in November 2016 on page 06, when talking about these kinds of "believes without bonds" it is possible to notice an apprehension with the maintenance of the temples. The author even addresses the no churcheds as swindlers of others faith, since they go to any temple without having a commitment with any community: "in these churches which they can participate whenever they want, there are believers who congregate, are members, fulfill their obligations, pay the tithes and make offers, worship God, hear the Word, urge and are urged, and live a life in communion. Otherwise, there would not be any church". The author do not glimpse the digital medias as a space where the services of the temple are already offered, in which a great number of ministers preaches, advises, prays, urges, organizes fund campaigns, etc.

No churcheds religious virtual communities appropriate themselves of religious discourse, but tend to escape from the logics of temples operation. We point out here one more transformation in the Pentecostal religiosity under mediatization. No other media device was able to compromise the existence of the temples more than the digital medias. Radio and TV appropriation by the Pentecostals modified the temples that got sophisticated and became temple-malls (Alencar, 2013), but they did not become obsolete.

The majority of such cyber Pentecostals do not identify themselves as churches members. Some goes to the temples only during events, but most of them are devoted to Pentecostal activism and, especially, to moral conservatism. The manifestations are not institutionalized but increasingly autonomous, without many references to glossolalia, miracles and prosperity; they have a more moralizing character and, almost always, look for political participation.

The activist positioning among the cyber Pentecostals is a mechanism to protect an identity that has been transformed under the changes of words asceticism. Until the 1980s, the Pentecostal religious stereotype, especially of women, was identifiable by physical appearance. Nowadays, the image of the conservative believer is no longer typically that one of long skirts and long hair, of suit and tie and that face with a serious expression. For the time being, it is know that a person is a "believer" not only because of his/her clothes, but mainly because of the discourse or how he /she publicly express his/her position. The Pentecostal identity foremost in the virtual communities is formed by the highly moralist and activist discourse. We believe that the moral behavior is not determined by the church or the minister, but by the God itself, as if "reprehensible" attitudes would attain God. The great question of this religious moralizing thought is that from which principles and lifestyles particular to a certain worldview are chosen, while others are condemned as if God has forbidden them. Pentecostal religious moralism is an identification mechanism. The classic Pentecostals, for example, have preserved habits and customs in a more radi-

¹⁹ Original title: "Os desigrejados".

cal way in order to differentiate themselves from new groups, predominantly the neo Pentecostals.

In this work, we call Theology of Morality not the asceticism imposed on people who go to the temples, but the kind of moral fundamentalism postulated in the digital medias, especially the ideal of life for the whole society and by which one should stand for. The aforementioned theology became more significant from the 2000s onwards due to the worsening of mediatization in society and religion. In the light of this theology, biblical texts are interpreted and projects are executed. As an example, the entire process of Pentecostal insertion in Brazilian political field is based on such moral foundation. It is a type of theology that presents some characteristic elements in the Pentecostal discursive formation: emphasis on contemporary moral crisis, a greater concern with society moralization than with the Evangelism and an erasure of eschatological message in face of “immoralities”. It would be a contradiction preaching the moral crisis as a biblical sign of the imminent coming Messiah, whilst the politicians promote themselves as “elect of God” to change society.

Theology of Morality works as mechanism of Pentecostals control. The obedient believer, in general, tends to enter into conflict of conscience as if he/she had sinned by having supported or voted for a particular party and “corrupt” candidate or having created or voted for some “immoral” bill. In this case, there is regret just like after had committed sin against God or the doctrine, together with the fear of suffer the sanctions because of the choice. There is also the opposite feeling, of retribution, as if by having supported the “politicians of Christ” in the struggle for morality he/she was playing his/her role of true Christian and, hence, he/she will have a divine retribution.

The fear of upset God is permeated in these religious minds. Pentecostals related God’s approval or disapproval to the judgment of the others brothers in the church, which means, being accused and/or approved by the individuals of the same group means upset or please God. Despite of the surveillance of each other, self-control is the most demanded, named self-control²⁰. In case of politics, for example, we have secret ballot, but not voting “on the brother” means a kind of disobedience, that is, voting contrary to the church orientation becomes a sin. Even without revealing the vote, the topic will cause suffering, discomfort and embarrassment, the notion of right or wrong is understood in a different way, since they believe they are watched and punished by a God who is everywhere and knows everything.

Such moral activism is related to the transformations of power relation in Brazil since the 1980s, which stimulated the Pentecostals politization, in particular after the end of the Dictatorship when the threats are enhanced in political representations:

²⁰ In Portuguese, there is a distinction between the two mentioned self-control. The first one is the capacity to control oneself. The second one is the proper term used by the church, called “domínio próprio”. Both have the same idea, but are expressed with different terms.

conservative evangelicals in the political sphere (ministers and members of the Evangelical Bench, many of whom identifies themselves like that) understand themselves as “elect of God” to conduct campaigns and actions in Brazil through parties and alliances of Right-wing (Cunha, 2017, p. 225).

This political-ideological alignment of Pentecostal institutions with the Right’s projects also appears as the reason for the disengagement of many believers from the churches. Different from the Theology of Morality projects and discourses, some cyber Pentecostals stand themselves. The EIG post from August 12, 2017 disseminated the text «Bolsonaro on them! The gospel without Jesus» by Pedro Almeida, published in the Blog Ativismo Protestante (AP):



Source: <https://www.facebook.com/evangelicaspelaigualdadedegenero/>.
Access in 08/31/2017.

Image 3. Post about alignment between evangelical and Bolsonaro

The text of Pedro Almeida criticizes the support the believers, notably the ones from the Assembly, have given to ultraconservative politicians such as Jair Bolsonaro: military and federal deputy for the Partido Progressista²¹ (PP), in his sixth mandate, it was the most voted in the state of Rio de Janeiro in 2014. The deputy is in favor of death penalty, military intervention, legalization of gun license, reducing the legal age. The alignment of (neo)Pentecostal institutions with the Right-wing party results in the maintenance of an attitude of believers’ exemption from the political debate. The Left is considered the enemy of “God” and it provides the defense of the moral conservatism, among other aspects. The Pentecostals, mainly the ones

²¹ A Right-Center wing party in Brazil, the Progressive Party, of liberal conservatism ideology.

from the Assembly, bring together in their discursive formation essential elements that are more and more articulated to the Right-wing power upturn project – it has suffered a political forces cooling from 1984 to 2014. The elements are: (1) anti-communism and anti-Petism, which means, they are contrary to the Workers Party (PT) and the Left in general; (2) anti-elite, they believe being fighting for the economically disadvantaged people; (3) anti-politics, since they discredit the politicians and prefer to elect religious, entrepreneurs or representatives of other social fields; (4) anti-intellectualism, they are charismatic religious who throughout the history got way from educational systems, including religious ones; and, finally, they are (5) moralists and conservatives.

These elements of Assembly discursive formation bring the Pentecostals closer to ultraconservative politicians, such as Bolsanaro who is evangelical. In his post Pedro declares himself as former-member of Assemblies of God, in the statement «the church I used to be member». Despite being away from the institution, he writes the column Opinião in the Blog Ativismo Protestante (AP) that groups no-churched associates and members of different evangelical denominations, (neo)Pentecostals or not. The blog is not institutional, but the statement of authorship is from Osmar Carvalho, member of the Evangelical Church Assembly of God in São Paulo – Belém Ministry. In the manifest published in the blog page it is declared that AP aims to question «pro-impeachment positions of some leaders linked to Evangelical churches, in particular the Pentecostals and neo Pentecostals, and oppose to the Evangelical Parliament Front».

Conclusion

The process of Pentecostal semiosis lead us to observe the shift of structures of capitalism productive emphasis to the media circulation devices which optimize the autonomy and present themselves as an inclusive opportunity for personal, affective and social practices. Such shift, among other aspects, puts the (neo)Pentecostal into digital medias logics of production. Searching the defense of rights and political participation outside the institutional walls, cyber Pentecostals and no churched associate themselves to the identification methods mainly activists. In the new ambience, the Pentecostal religiosity is under pressure of activism, guiding topics and debates that circulate around the digital medias. Thus, affirm the moral stance demand in the contemporaneity.

Religious links logics are not the same after the proliferation of digital medias access. The possibility to constitute, proclaim and distinguish oneself as a religious, through new medias, dismiss the institutional affiliation. In this configuration, diverse groups and autonomous religious link themselves to the title of Pentecostal, but without churches. A mediated religiosity emerges aligned with a referral identity. A complexity established in the contemporaneity.

The evolution of Pentecostal semiosis is part of the growing of social processes logics interpenetration to mediatization logics. Media phenomena are in the origin of social systems (Verón, 2013), thus they also are a pre-condition to the religiosity establishment and maintenance. That way, the Pentecostal mediatization arrive at a stage in which the institutions depend on and/or are affected by the intersection in the logics and the operators of this new ambience.

References

- Alencar, Gedeon. (2013). *Matriz Pentecostal Brasileira: Assembleia de Deus 1911-2011*. Rio de Janeiro: Novos Diálogos.
- Araújo, Israel de. (2014) *Dicionário do Movimento Pentecostal*. Rio de Janeiro: CPAD.
- Bauman, Zygmunt. (1998). *Modernidade e Holocausto*. Rio de Janeiro: Jorge Zahar Ed.
- Braga, José Luis. (2015). Lógicas da Mídia, lógicas da Midiatização? In: Fausto Neto, Antônio et.al (Eds.). *Relatos de investigaciones sobre mediatizaciones* (p. 15-32). Rosário: UNR Editora. Editorial de la Universidad Nacional de Rosario.E-Book. ISBN 978-987-702-101-1.
- Campos, João Pedroso de. (2016). Nas capitais, 250 candidatos vêm de templos evangélicos. *Veja.com*. Retrieved June 8, 2017, from <http://veja.abril.com.br/politica/nas-capitais-250-candidatos-vem-de-templos-evangelicos/>.
- Campos, Leonildo Silveira. (2002). *Os “políticos de Cristo” – uma análise do comportamento político de protestantes históricos e pentecostais no Brasil*. Paper presented at the GT Religião e Sociedade, XXVI ANPOCS, Caxambu, 2002.
- Cunha, Magali do Nascimento. (2017) *Do Púlpito às Mídias Sociais: Evangélicos na política e ativismo digital*. Curitiba: Prismas.
- Fausto Neto, Antonio. (2001) *Desmontagens de sentidos: leituras de discursos midiáticos*. João Pessoa: Editora da UFPB.
- Fausto Neto, Antonio. AD. (2011) Rumos de uma nova analítica. In: Ferreira, G. M., Sampaio, A. & Fausto Neto, A. (Eds.). *Mídia, discurso e sentido*. (p. 27-42). Salvador: EDUFBA.
- Freston, Paul. (2011). Como será a igreja evangélica brasileira de 1940? *Revista Ultimato*. . Retrieved May 20, 2017, from <http://www.ultimato.com.br/revista/artigos/333/como-sera-a-igreja-evangelica-brasileira-de-2040>.
- Gomes, Pedro Gilberto. (2017). *Dos meios à Midiatização: um conceito em evolução*. São Leopoldo: Editora Unisinos.
- Hervieu-Léger, Danièle. (2008). *O peregrino e o convertido: a religião em movimento*. Petrópolis: Vozes.
- Hjarvard, Stig. (2014). *A Midiatização da Cultura e da Sociedade*. São Leopoldo: Editora Unisinos
- Lévy, Pierre. (1956). *Cyberculture*. Tra. Robert Bononno. Minnesota: University of Minnesota Press.

- Lipovetsky, Gilles & Serroy, Jean. (2011) *A cultura□mundo: resposta a uma sociedade desorientada*. Trad. Maria Lucia Machado. São Paulo: Companhia das Letras.
- Ruffato, Luiz. (2016). A Igreja Universal avança. *El País*. Retrieved June 22, 2017, from https://brasil.elpais.com/brasil/2016/07/05/opinion/1467746827_994929.html.
- Ruffato, Luiz. (2016). Temer inaugura a república evangélica. *El País*. Retrieved June 8, 2017, from https://brasil.elpais.com/brasil/2016/06/08/opinion/1465385098_545583.html.
- Silva, Pr. Carlos Roberto. (2016). Os desigrejados. *Mensagem da Paz*. 86. Nº 1578, p.06.
- Verón, Eliseo. (1980). *A produção de sentido*. Trad. Alceu Dias et all. São Paulo: Cultrix.
- Verón, Eliseo. (2013). *La Semiosis Social 2: ideas, momentos, interpretantes*. Ciudad Autónoma de Buenos Aires: Paidós.
- Verón, Eliseo. (2014). Teoria da mediatização: uma perspectiva semioantropológica e algumas de suas consequências. *Matizes*. 8(1), 13-19.