

The production of future: chronotope and agency in the Middle Ages

Schmolinsky, Sabine

Veröffentlichungsversion / Published Version

Zeitschriftenartikel / journal article

Zur Verfügung gestellt in Kooperation mit / provided in cooperation with:

GESIS - Leibniz-Institut für Sozialwissenschaften

Empfohlene Zitierung / Suggested Citation:

Schmolinsky, S. (2013). The production of future: chronotope and agency in the Middle Ages. *Historical Social Research*, 38(3), 93-104. <https://doi.org/10.12759/hsr.38.2013.3.93-104>

Nutzungsbedingungen:

Dieser Text wird unter einer CC BY Lizenz (Namensnennung) zur Verfügung gestellt. Nähere Auskünfte zu den CC-Lizenzen finden Sie hier:

<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/deed.de>

Terms of use:

This document is made available under a CC BY Licence (Attribution). For more information see:

<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0>

The Production of Future. Chronotope and Agency in the Middle Ages

Sabine Schmolinsky*

Abstract: »Die Produktion der Zukunft. Chronotopos und agency im Mittelalter«. This paper discusses Mikhail M. Bakhtin's notion of *chronotope* applied to the Christian concept of the two futures to be and to come, which basically are to be distinguished by their respective spatio-temporal relations. These require a consideration of the involvement of human agency and practice in processes of future. This can be particularly well investigated within the Medieval tradition. It will be argued that both the individual's future on earth and the collectively operating eschatological future induced medieval Christians to activity based on experience and predictability in matters of everyday life, or on prophecy and faith in postmortal issues. Here the chronotopicity of the future in a religious perspective might foster a better understanding of the medieval practices and agency which engendered the future for which they were meant to provide.

Keywords: Mikhail M. Bakhtin, chronotope, future, eschatology, Christianity, medieval history.

1. Introduction

Hearing or reading the word 'future' makes us think about time. The temporal order of times-to-come inevitably seems to frame the basic modes of human perception and action in everyday life. Since 'presence' cannot be realized in a definite form, as it elapses the very moment when grasped, thinking future touches on the past without ever being connectable to it except by mental operation or an individual feeling of being present.

Conceiving 'future' in the European tradition means to refer to two aspects of the notion, since the Latin word *futurum* designates all that will be as well as all that will come. This latter sense of arrival is conveyed, too, by the Latin word *adventus*, which substantially points to Christian conceptions of time, including the supposed second arrival of the saviour Jesus Christ at the end of times. *Futurum* or *futura* which will be correspond to the evolution of material or immaterial objects unfolding, developing and actualizing their further exist-

* Sabine Schmolinsky, Universität Erfurt, Historisches Seminar, Nordhäuser Str. 63, 99089 Erfurt, Germany; sabine.schmolinsky@uni-erfurt.de.

ence or their potentialities. These processes or even their results may be predicted by projection or extrapolation through means of knowledge of present issues or experience. *Futurum* or *futura* which will come, however, appear to be open to generally the emerging other and specifically divine promise and prophecy. This type of future is concealed from mankind but may be enlightened to a certain extent through faith in God's biblical prediction and hope for its fulfillment (Greshake 2009).

In a Christian perspective, however, the two types of future may be designed as differing even more. Considering their spatiality, *futurum* that will be is destined to take place on earth, whereas *futurum* as *adventus* will start on earth, but then destroy it, including its temporal dimensions (ibid.). Both of these patterns prove time and space to be intrinsically tied to each other. The future following the former pattern will be performed by human operation within the familiar order of spatio-temporality, as daily evidence shows. The latter type is imagined to lead to an indefinite open space characterized by two orders of existence in timelessness. These are supposed to be classified according to the former merits of their eternal residents as heaven and hell. Thus human agency is conceptualized to have an impact on the individual future as well as on the collective future of mankind, since the old world and humanity will completely be extinguished and replaced by a new world.

This inextricable connectedness of future space and time is conveyed by textual configurations purporting sequences of events which, in consequence, may be submitted to narratological devices. On these grounds future qualified as a spatio-temporally determined evolution in times to come is readable as a *chronotope* in the Bakhtinian sense. It will be argued that the concept particularly applies to the *adventus* pattern of future and that agency is inseparably bound to the relationship of space and time. Medieval paradigms illustrate the ways in which authoritative texts and ideas shaped interpretations of eschatological agents in shifting spatio-temporal environments and made prophecy transform to religious knowledge.

2. *Chronotope*: Dimensions of a Metaphor on Real Grounds

In the essay 'Forms of Time and of the Chronotope in the Novel, Notes toward a Historical Poetics' (1937-1938) included in his book *The Dialogic Imagination* (published Moscow 1975), Mikhail M. Bakhtin (1895-1975) argues that his application of *chronotope* in literary theory is based on a real substrate of the term in science introduced by Albert Einstein's Theory of Relativity:

The special meaning it has in relativity theory is not important for our purposes; we are borrowing it for literary criticism almost as a metaphor (almost, but not entirely). What counts for us is the fact that it expresses the inseparability

of space and time (time as the fourth dimension of space). [...]. We understand the chronotope as a formally constitutive category of literature; we will not deal with the chronotope in other areas of culture (Bakhtin 1981, 84).

The concept of leaving a tiny perspective on reality by “borrowing it [...] almost as a metaphor (almost, but not entirely)” (ibid.) well matches the use of the term in yet another extra-textual context – not excluded by Bakhtin – which can be designated as the realm of agency and practice.

Future as a Bakhtinian chronotope refers to his notion of essential chronotopes which may embrace unlimited numbers of smaller chronotopes:

We have been speaking so far only of the major chronotopes, those that are most fundamental and wide-ranging. But each such chronotope can include within it an unlimited number of minor chronotopes (ibid., 252; within chapter “X. Concluding Remarks”, written in 1973).

Considering the two aspects of future mentioned above, two subchronotopes, liminality and rupture, appear to have some impact on the configurations of the future to be and the future to come. In the first case liminality may indicate the mode of prediction which is intended to permit prognosis and planning for the purpose of prudent future action in space and time. In the latter case this subchronotope’s reference shifts to prophecy as the mode of foretelling the unpredictable. Whereas prediction draws upon the existing world and its spatio-temporal relationships, prophecy has to envisage another world that is unknown to terrestrials. More precisely it has to narrate it, thus creating a new world which is constituted on its own specific chronotopic conditions.

The subchronotope of rupture is inspired by Bakhtin’s concept of rupture within the course of time and the sequence of incidents in the ancient Greek romance, the so-called “adventure-time” (ibid., 89). Here rupture opens a gap for interventions of the supernatural which may manifest itself through oracles, auspices or dreams:

Moments of adventurous time occur at those points when the normal course of events, the normal, intended or purposeful sequence of life’s events is interrupted. These points provide an opening for the intrusion of nonhuman forces – fate, gods, villains – and it is precisely these forces, and not the heroes, who in adventure-time take all the initiative. [...]. Such things are better understood through fortune-telling, omens, legends, oracular predictions, prophetic dreams and premonitions (ibid., 95).

In the future that will be rupture may show up as contingency limiting action and agency up to death, which at the same time is a preliminary of the future to come. Its outbreak will disrupt all previously known spatio-temporal orders in favour of a new space and a new time, which only may be touched on by the prophetic narrative mentioned above.

The concept of a prophetic narrative illuminating the otherwise completely unknown future refers to Bakhtin’s identification of future as a “*historical inversion*”, which is meant to be an “‘inversion’ of time”. This forms part of

the temporal regime of the ancient novel and is characterized as having been particularly important to the literary tradition.

The essence of this inversion is found in the fact that mythological and artistic thinking locates such categories as purpose, ideal, justice, perfection, the harmonious condition of man and society and the like in the *past* (ibid., 147).

Thus the prophetic narrative on the future to come may be influenced by mythic narratives regarding pre-times in a more or less topologically specified space. In Christian thinking this applies to the narrative on the paradise (Stolz et al. 1995).

In a Religious Studies perspective the paradise presents itself as a space of desire whose features do not transcend the attributes of spatio-temporal orders existing on earth but have to be (re-)formulated according to the experiences of the particular culture in which the notion is intended to unfold its vigour and acceptance. Thus a rhetorically or narratologically informed conception of a specific literary tradition as the origin of writing conventions on the paradise does not adequately account for it (Auffarth 2002, 39sq.). This includes that a ‘paradise narrative’ genre, which might be assumed or established corresponding to Bakhtin’s concept of the constitutive power of chronotopes regarding genre (Bakhtin 1981, 84sq.), may not be presupposed without historicizing it in comparison to each time’s contemporary patterns of experience, perceptions and interpretations.

“Historical inversion” of past and future, however, implicates a further trait, which Bakhtin conceptualizes as an enrichment of particularly the past “at the expense of the future” thus becoming less substantial and concrete in its contents (ibid., 147). In order to attribute reality to an ideal, this would be imagined as having been realized in a former Golden Age or as existing in a somehow far off somewhere in the then present age. Eschatology in Bakhtin’s view is just another model of the same movement of deflation of the future, since the latter is marked as the absolute cessation of all creatures and the whole material world previously having existed. Furthermore, eschatological thinking would tend to depreciate the present as an indefinite short period of no interest or significance (ibid., 147sq.).

3. What will be? Medieval Arrangements for the Future

This question sounds banal insofar as in their practices of daily life medieval men and women took care of their activities and occupations, their families and kinship, their households, their relationships, and their health as well as their fellow men of other epochs did and do. There is a rich variety of medieval sources which may be consulted, for instance, medieval self-testimonials (Schmolinsky 2012a). Political and (socio-)economic action (Wood 2002) imagined future as ranging from a short-term or a long-term period up to dispo-

sitions “for ever”. More intensely than historiography, medieval charters provide extended insight into the corresponding practices and their spatio-temporal regimes. Their tradition, e.g. in the Holy Roman Empire, amounts at least to tens of thousands.

In a medievalist’s historical-anthropological perspective, however notoriously, the role and impact of religious belief have to be marked as a distinctive feature of the age. Notwithstanding the possibility of a formulaic use of topoi and conventions, medieval life and agency in Latin Europe appear to have been deeply influenced by Christianity in all issues of human existence, and the essential effect of the future on an individual’s afterlife obviously has been a field of major concern (Niederhorn-Bruck 2013; Slenczka 2007; Van Bueren 2005; Minois 1996). Its two types, future that will be and *adventus*, including their spatial implications, thereby merge to a certain degree with regard to caring for the souls of the dead as well as one’s own.

From Late Antiquity onwards the basic Christian device for affecting the dead’s conditions have been prayers. A famous specimen of this practice is the early Christian martyr Perpetua († 203 CE), who during her incarceration saw by vision her dead brother Dinocrates suffering in a dreadful place of afterlife and was able to relieve him of his pains by praying (Habermehl 2004, 78-83; Trumbower 2001, 76-90; Perkins 1995, 108sq.). Since the late 8th century CE the offices of monks, nuns, and canons included prayers for the deceased (Rüther 1997; Bärsch 2009). As martyrologies preserved the numerous saints’ names, necrologies and obituaries or confraternity books maintained in monasteries and churches compiled the names of the dead for liturgical commemoration on their calendar day of death. They gathered monastic persons as well as clergy and laity. Depending on local circumstances they could be continued throughout the Middle Ages up to the 15th century or the Protestant Reformation (Neiske 2009; Lemaitre 2011).

A further means of care were last wills. In rich numbers from all over Europe testaments of medieval men and women have survived, particularly in urban sites, which testify to their authors’ intention to pass their mundane property on to named heirs (Weimar et al. 1997). Those last wills appear to be located in space and time by their testators as well as the envisioned recipients, thus generating a relationship connecting “l’avenir des morts à celui des vivants” (Chiffolleau 2011, Avant-propos), although partly differing spaces, terrestrial and otherworldly, are addressed. The chronotopicity of the medieval act of handing down, however, does not stop with the spatio-temporal relations of inheritance, but includes, as a major purpose of action, the future condition of the testators’ souls, which was deemed to be susceptible to prayer and charity performed by those who benefitted from the religious endowments of the deceased. The practice of religious endowment has to be estimated as one of the most wide-spread and influential social phenomena of the Middle Ages (Borgolte 1997; Lusiardi 2000). It is closely connected to the concept of *memoria*, which

designates a variety of medieval practices and purposes of the commemoration of the dead and has evolved into one of the most prolific medievalist paradigms (Oexle 1995).

The chronotopic knot of gift and bliss is mapped by the Christian idea of a postmortal purgatory configuring the dead's future up to eventually the Final Judgment. As recent research has emphasized, the notion of a post mortem purification dates back to ancient conceptual images not necessarily linked to a particular space or place where the deceased should sojourn (Moreira 2010; Merkt 2005). In the course of the medieval centuries, however, theological reflection, visionary evidence, and popular belief engendered and enriched the concept of a personal repentance of sins still unatoned in the hour of death that literally and visually encompassed the imagination of a specialized space (Dinzelbacher 2007). This intermediate stage would continue till, at the latest, Judgment Day. Rethinking Bakhtin's model of historical inversion, this purgatory would be related to the past, the individual's past, but nevertheless comprise a meaningful shift to him or her through a certain type of acting shaped according to this world's religious practices.

The dead's future, paralleling men's respective lifetime and future, thus appears as a future that will be, preparing the future that will come. As a chronotope it may be characterized by the subchronotope of liminality, since it was subject to a prediction which had a bearing on medieval contemporaries, particularly because they felt confident that neither space nor time of the purgatory would last forever (Müller 2009; Hartinger 2009).

4. What will be? Medieval Approaches to the End of Times

Prediction in a setting of chronotopic liminality did not only appeal to individual medieval Christians reinforcing their efforts to enhance their chance of future salvation but to Christendom as a whole. The New Testament conception of the end of times, however, includes a reservation scheduling a specific disposition of the eschatological events envisaged. According to their historical origin, the canonical texts make Paul of Tarsus († after 60 CE) the first to have conceptualized a final conversion to Christianity of all peoples, before the end may occur:

For I would not, brethren, that ye should be ignorant of this mystery, lest ye should be wise in your own conceits; that blindness in part is happened to Israel, until the fullness of the Gentiles be come in. And so all Israel shall be saved: as it is written (Romans 11:25-26, written in 56 CE; henceforward: The Holy Bible, 2004).

Each within a context of eschatological predictions pronounced by Jesus, the Gospel according to Mark (13:10: "And the gospel must first be published

among all nations”, probably written shortly after 70 CE), and later on the Gospel according to Matthew (24:14: “And this gospel of the kingdom shall be preached in all the world for a witness unto all nations; and then shall the end come”, written c. 90 CE) addressed the whole world as an object to mission preceding the end. Basically the assumption was established that space and time in their dimensions acquainted to mankind would be limited. Uncertainty regarding the date had to be maintained (e.g. Mark 13:29-33 and Matthew 24:32-36; Acts of the Apostles 1:7, written c. 90-100 CE; II Peter 3:8, written c. 110 CE; cf. Möhring 2000, 17-28).

Before being baptized, however, the non-Christians would assume a partly pivotal role in the scenario of the last days. This particularly applies to the Jews, since a specific adjacency to the Antichrist (McGinn 2000, 33-109) was ascribed to them. Patristic theologians and prophecies originating from respectively Late Antiquity or the Early Middle Ages exposed them as main followers of the Antichrist, who was himself designated as a Jew. Thus Augustine of Hippo (354-430 CE), Sophronius Eusebius Hieronymus (c. 347-419/420 CE) or Isidore of Seville (c. 560?-636 CE) explained that the Jews, who had opposed Jesus Christ, would adhere to Christ’s deceptive opponent (Rauh 1979, 129, 133sq.; Emmerson 1981, 27, 46). The Antichrist’s Jewish origin was taken to be assured since the patristics (Emmerson 1981, 46, 79-83, 214sq.; Voß 2010, 197-200). His future ‘biography’ (Emmerson 1981, 90-5) was widely spread through the prophecy of the *Sibylla Tiburtina* (Sackur 1898, 115-87; Holdenried 2006), Pseudo-Methodius’ *Revelationes* (Aerts and Kortekaas 1998) and Adso’s of Montier-en-Der *De ortu et tempore Antichristi* including the treatises depending on it (Adso Dervensis 1976; cf. Schmolinsky 2012b, 67-72). Their predictions, or prophecies, identified the Antichrist and his followers within a chronotopic frame of this world’s future as that somehow short span of time that would be filled with disaster, suffering and persecution to all mankind. Those were predictable through substantially known categories such as tyranny and seduction but would assume vast and previously unknown proportions which were the object of prophecy.

This period of a collective future appears to be marked by a conspicuously reduced diversification. There are no more varieties of social, cultural, ethnic, or geographical aspects but just lines of demarcation following religious faith which delineate inclusion and exclusion in a globalizing way. A sole exception to this increasing reduction of spatiality within the chronotope are the so-called enclosed nations, mythic peoples, which were held to have been locked up in the Caucasus by Alexander the Great and which would be released as Gog and Magog in the context of the reign of Antichrist (Emmerson 1981, 84-8). While participating in the chronotope of ‘future’, they are at the same time a specimen of Bakhtin’s notion of “historical inversion”. However, reinforcing their spatial presence, medieval cartographers inserted them in their maps, e.g. the Ebstorf Map, locating them in the North(-East) (Gow 1998; Baumgärtner 2011, 220sq.).

5. What will come? Medieval Mappings of a Rupture

Future's liminality may be interpreted as shifting to rupture when Antichrist is killed, for his destruction will be accomplished by godly intervention. The subsequent changes are conceptualized as fundamental to the whole of the world which will cease to exist in its spatio-temporal extension. Evidence for this is found in the New Testament apocalypses, namely with Matthew (24:1-31) and the visionary John (Revelation 14:6-20, 10, written c. 90-95 CE). Apart from cosmic cataclysm, it is especially the Last Judgment that marks a watershed for the imaginary of the future to come. According to the Gospel of Matthew (25:31-46) it will be executed in a strictly binary mode of discrimination of the good and the evil, including a final destination to all individuals of all nations. The Visionary John, however, was the first to note the impossibility of a further existence of the hitherto existing earth and heaven: "And I saw a great white throne, and him that sat on it, from whose face the earth and the heaven fled away; and there was found no place for them." (Revelation 20:11) After the sentencing of the dead John catches sight of a new heaven and a new earth, and particularly of a new spatial configuration meant to be the dwelling space of the people of God in a future forever (Revelation 21:1-3). This space is designed to be urban, a new Jerusalem which accounts for the "glory of God" (Revelation 21:11).

The perception of a new city comprising God's presence appeals to Bakhtin's notion of "historical inversion," if the chronotope of the paradise before the fall of mankind is taken as a subject of reference to the (mythic) past. Bakhtin himself, however, did not pay much attention to the "advent of God's Kingdom", since he was focused on the mode of emptying the future through eschatology resulting in the destruction of all that exists (Bakhtin 1981, 148). Considering Bakhtin's chronotopic stop with rupture, the question of prophecy concerning time and space after rupture is to be posed. Obviously John's vision referred to a geographical and religious site known to his audience, although the Temple had been destroyed in 70 CE. The celestial Jerusalem, however, was to lose its former traits of reality and concreteness particularly in the second and third century CE (Markschies 2000, 304-11). But nevertheless it represented a not-emptied future to the faithful, a plenitude which would be ordered in a specific way of its own.

Medieval exegesis generally does not reify the heavenly Jerusalem but frequently interprets its features allegorically or spiritually following the contents of the apocalyptic visions. There is but one exegete, the Friar Minor Alexander Minorita († 1271), who in a (c.) 1242 revised version of his historicizing commentary on John's Revelation concludes that the heavenly Jerusalem (Revelation 21 and 22) must have been constructed before Judgment Day. He identifies his brethren, the Friar Minors and additionally the Dominicans, as those who signify the new City through their mendicant form of life imitating the apos-

ties' lives and their preaching which both are intended to realize the denotation of Jerusalem's name: *visio pacis aeternae* already on earth (Schmolinsky 2002, 539-41).

6. Conclusion: The Chronotopicity of Future and Agency

It may have become apparent that in a Christian perspective particularly focused during the centuries of the Middle Ages, the future was partitioned into several segments which referred to different spaces and times and it was up to each single Christian to provide for his or her own fate in the times to come more or less rapidly. Additionally, and this feature seems to have marked medieval imagination and practice in a more prominent way than those of other epochs, the living could and should feel capable of supporting the dead's otherworldly existence in a theologically intricate, intermediate status, which at least in popular piety was supposed to be located in purgatory. Thus this world's circumstances were steeped in non-innerworldly issues tinging mental habits and generating action for the benefit of the spiritual well-being of the deceased souls as well as of one's own. Operating within the familiar dimensions of space and time, Christian care for the dead and their future referred to the past, e.g. their former lives, insofar as it was intended to better their liminal situation of penance while approaching the prophesied final rupture performed by Christ's second advent and his Judgment.

Though temporally indexed as a lexeme, the medieval Latin Christians' concept of future thus has proved not to be conceivable without reference to space. That is why Bakhtin's theory of chronotopes has been deemed most adequate to the representations of future described above. It accounts for the spatio-temporality and variety of future within a system of narratives on issues of religious belief. Its structure may be augmented by minor chronotopes, such as liminality and rupture, in order to specify the chronotopic order. The application of the notion to the Christian conceptualization of future, however, required the introduction of a further feature to make the theory work regarding the historical phenomena. Human agency crystallized as an indispensable factor of the chronotope future. In the plain sense of a day-to-day future, agency might seem a category all too obvious. In the sense of a future informed by piety, however, agency is not necessarily self-evident. As in the course of time medieval Christians shaped and refined their practices and imaginations concerning the future to be for themselves and their dead and the future to come for all mankind, they came to share the narrative by configuring its chronotopic dimensions. Being part of the narrative and pushing it on, they engendered what appeared to be future. Agency thus promoted the production of future, a future which was designed according to a variety of chronotopic patterns.

References

- Adso Dervensis. 1976. *De ortu et tempore Antichristi necnon et tractatus qui ab eo dependunt*, ed. Daniël Verhelst. Turnhout: Brepols.
- Aerts, Willem J., and Georgius A. A. Kortekaas, eds. 1998. *Die Apokalypse des Pseudo-Methodius: Die ältesten griechischen und lateinischen Übersetzungen*, 2 vols. Leuven: Peeters.
- Auffarth, Christoph. 2002. *Irdische Wege und himmlischer Lohn: Kreuzzug, Jerusalem und Fegefeuer in religionswissenschaftlicher Perspektive*. Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht.
- Bärsch, Jürgen. 2009. Totenoffizium. In *Lexikon für Theologie und Kirche*, 3rd revised edition, ed. Walter Kasper, vol. 10, 130. Freiburg et al.: Herder.
- Bakhtin, Mikhail M. 1981[1975]. Forms of time and of the chronotope in the novel: Notes toward a historical poetics. In *The dialogic imagination: Four essays*, ed. Michael Holquist, trans. Caryl Emerson and Michael Holquist, 84-258. Austin and London: University of Texas Press.
- Baumgärtner, Ingrid. 2011. Erzählungen kartieren: Jerusalem in mittelalterlichen Kartenräumen. In *Projektion – Reflexion – Ferne: Räumliche Vorstellungen und Denkfiguren im Mittelalter*, ed. Sonja Glauch, Susanne Köbele and Uta Störmer-Caysa, 193-223. Berlin et al.: Walter de Gruyter.
- The Holy Bible. 2004. *The Holy Bible containing the old and new testaments*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press [King James version. Standard Text Edition].
- Borgolte, Michael. 1997. Stiftung. I. Abendländischer Westen. In *Lexikon des Mittelalters*, ed. Norbert Angermann et al., vol. 8, 178-80. Munich: LexMA Verlag.
- Chiffolleau, Jacques. 2011[1980]. *La comptabilité de l'au-delà: Les hommes, la mort et la religion dans la région d'Avignon à la fin du Moyen-Âge. Préface de Jacques Le Goff*. Paris: Éditions Albin Michel.
- Dinzelbacher, Peter, ed. 2007 [1997]. Das Fegefeuer in der schriftlichen und bildlichen Katechese des Mittelalters: In *Von der Welt durch die Hölle zum Paradies – das mittelalterliche Jenseits*, 99-163. Paderborn et al.: Ferdinand Schöningh.
- Emmerson, Richard Kenneth. 1981. *Antichrist in the Middle Ages: A study of medieval apocalypticism, art, and literature*. Manchester: Manchester University Press.
- Gow, Andrew. 1998. Gog and Magog on mappaemundi [!] and early printed world maps: Orientalizing ethnography in the apocalyptic tradition. *Journal of Early Modern History* 2 (1): 61-88.
- Greshake, Gisbert. 2009. Zukunft. In *Lexikon für Theologie und Kirche*, 3rd revised edition, ed. Walter Kasper, vol. 10, 1497sq. Freiburg et al.: Herder.
- Habermehl, Peter. 2004. *Perpetua und der Ägypter oder Bilder des Bösen im frühen afrikanischen Christentum: Ein Versuch zur Passio sanctarum Perpetuae et Felicitatis*. Berlin: Walter de Gruyter.
- Hartinger, Walter. 2009. Fegefeuer. VIII. Frömmigkeitsgeschichtlich. In *Lexikon für Theologie und Kirche*, 3rd revised edition, ed. Walter Kasper, vol. 3, 1209sq. Freiburg et al.: Herder.
- Holdenried, Anke. 2006. *The Sibyl and her scribes: Manuscripts and interpretation of the Latin Sibylla Tiburtina c. 1050-1500*. Aldershot, Hampshire: Ashgate.

- Lemaitre, Jean-Loup. 2011. De Léopold Delisle à Joachim Wollasch: 150 ans de travaux et de recherches sur les nécrologes et les obituaires. In *Wege der Erinnerung im und an das Mittelalter: Festschrift für Joachim Wollasch zum 80. Geburtstag*, ed. Andreas Sohn, 3-17. Bochum: Verlag Dr. Dieter Winkler.
- Lusiardi, Ralf. 2000. *Stiftung und städtische Gesellschaft: Religiöse und soziale Aspekte des Stiftungsverhaltens im spätmittelalterlichen Stralsund*. Berlin: Akademie Verlag.
- Markschies, Christoph. 2000. Himmlisches und irdisches Jerusalem im antiken Christentum. In *La Cité de Dieu: Die Stadt Gottes. 3. Symposium Strasbourg, Tübingen, Uppsala 19.-23. September 1998 in Tübingen*, ed. Martin Hengel, Siegfried Mittmann, and Anna Maria Schwemer, 303-50. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck.
- McGinn, Bernard. 2000 [1994]. *Antichrist: Two thousand years of the human fascination with evil*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Merkt, Andreas. 2005. *Das Fegefeuer: Entstehung und Funktion einer Idee*. Darmstadt: Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft.
- Minois, Georges. 1996. *Histoire de l'avenir des prophètes à la prospective*. Paris: Fayard.
- Möhring, Hannes. 2000. *Der Weltkaiser der Endzeit: Entstehung, Wandel und Wirkung einer tausendjährigen Weissagung*. Stuttgart: Jan Thorbecke Verlag.
- Moreira, Isabel. 2010. *Heaven's purge: Purgatory in Late Antiquity*. Oxford, et al.: Oxford University Press.
- Müller, Gerhard Ludwig. 2009. Fegefeuer. III. Historisch-theologisch. IV. Systematisch-theologisch. In *Lexikon für Theologie und Kirche*, 3rd revised edition, ed. Walter Kasper, vol. 3, 1204-8. Freiburg et al.: Herder.
- Neiske, Franz. 2009. Die Ordnung der Memoria: Formen necrologischer Tradition im Klosterverband. In *Institution und Charisma: Festschrift für Gert Melville zum 65. Geburtstag*, ed. Franz J. Felten, Annette Kehnel and Stefan Weinfurter, 127-37. Köln et al: Böhlau Verlag.
- Niederhorn-Bruck, Meta. 2013. Apokalypse – Liber vitae – Libri vitae oder Gottes Wissen und des Menschen Tun in den Libri vitae. In *Abendländische Apokalyptik. Kompendium zur Genealogie der Endzeit*, ed. Veronika Wieser et al., 371-90. Berlin: Akademie Verlag.
- Oexle, Otto Gerhard, ed. 1995. Memoria als Kultur. In *Memoria als Kultur*, 9-78. Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht.
- Perkins, Judith. 1995. *The suffering self: Pain and narrative representation in the early Christian era*. London et al: Routledge.
- Rauh, Horst Dieter. 1979. *Das Bild des Antichrist im Mittelalter: Von Tyconius zum Deutschen Symbolismus*, 2nd revised edition. Münster: Aschendorff.
- Rüther, Andreas. 1997. Totenoffizium. In *Lexikon des Mittelalters*, vol. 8, 896sq. Munich: LexMA Verlag.
- Sackur, Ernst. 1898. *Sibyllinische Texte und Forschungen: Pseudomethodius, Adso und die Tiburtinische Sibylle*. Halle (Saale): Max Niemeyer.
- Schmolinsky, Sabine. 2002. Prophezeite Geschichte und früher Joachitismus in Deutschland: Zur Apokalypsendeutung des Alexander Minorita. In *Ende und Vollendung: Eschatologische Perspektiven im Mittelalter [...]*, ed. Jan A. Aertsen and Martin Pickavé, 525-44. Berlin et al.: de Gruyter.

- Schmolinsky, Sabine. 2012a. *Sich schreiben in der Welt des Mittelalters: Begriffe und Konturen einer mediävistischen Selbstzeugnisforschung*. Bochum: Verlag Dr. Dieter Winkler.
- Schmolinsky, Sabine. 2012b. Die Zeit der Anderen: Juden, „Heiden“, „Ketzer“ im christlichen Geschichtsdenken. In *Religionen in Nachbarschaft: Pluralismus als Markenzeichen der europäischen Religionsgeschichte*, ed. Christoph Bultmann, Jörg Rüpke, and Sabine Schmolinsky, 61-74, 230-4. Münster: Aschendorff Verlag.
- Slenczka, Notger. 2007. Der endgültige Schrecken: Das Jüngste Gericht und die Angst in der Religion des Mittelalters. In *Angst und Schrecken im Mittelalter: Ursachen, Funktionen, Bewältigungsstrategien*, ed. Annette Gerok-Reiter and Sabine Obermaier = *Das Mittelalter* 12 (1): 97-112.
- Stolz, Fritz, et al. 1995. Paradies I-VII. In *Theologische Realenzyklopädie*, ed. Gerhard Müller, vol. 25, 705-26. Berlin et al.: de Gruyter.
- Trumbower, Jeffrey A. 2001. *Rescue for the dead: The posthumous salvation of non-Christians in early Christianity*. Oxford et al.: Oxford University Press.
- Van Bueren, Truus. 2005. Care for the here and the hereafter: A multitude of possibilities. In *Care for the here and the hereafter: Memoria, art and ritual in the Middle Ages*, ed. Truus van Bueren and Andrea Van Leerdam, 13-34. Turnhout: Brepols.
- Voß, Rebekka. 2010. Propter seditionis hebraicae: Judenfeindliche Apokalyptik und ihre Auswirkungen auf den jüdischen Messianismus. In *Antichrist: Konstruktionen von Feindbildern*, ed. Wolfram Brandes and Felicitas Schmieder, 197-217. Berlin: Akademie Verlag.
- Weimar, Peter, et al. 1997. Testament. In *Lexikon des Mittelalters*, ed. Norbert Angermann et al., vol. 8, 563-73. Munich: LexMA Verlag.
- Wood, Diana. 2002. *Medieval economic thought*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.